Journal of Posthumanism
2024
Volume: 4, No: 2, pp. 2427–2442
ISSN: 2634-3576 (Print) | ISSN 2634-3584 (Online)
posthumanism.co.uk

DOI: https://doi.org/10.63332/joph.v4i2.4271

Economic Resilience and Reintegration Management: Examining Satisfaction among Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling Survivors

Salman Azam Joiya[1], Muhammad Khyzer Bin Dost[2], Muhammad Ali[3], Ambreen Jabeen Shah[4], Husnain Tariq[5]

Abstract

Trafficking in persons is a crime and form of exploitation which leaves victims dependent economically and financial rewards to those who make it happen. Another aspect of the phenomenon is, in fact, Factors underlying the economic satisfaction of a human trafficking victim and a migrant are considered in the present study. smuggling. In this case, data of 419 persons, who are associated with trafficking and smuggling of migrants are studied. and analysed. The research is centered on key factors including income, debt burden, health, children's The economic satisfaction of human is determined by educational, educational background, marital status and gender trafficking victims. In addition, the influence of income source, outstanding debt, family size and financial stress on physical activity levels were examined. The impacts of the illegal migration victims on the economic satisfaction are explored. is looking at these variables by examining, to give relevant information on the determinants of the economic welfare of the victims in both situations. The results provide insight into the economic satisfaction of these vulnerable groups and are crucial for policy makers and service providers seeking to tackle the needs of human trafficking/ illegal migration victims.

Keywords: *Illegal migration, Human Trafficking, Economic Satisfaction, Ordered Logistic Regression, Logistic regression, Socio-Economic Indicators.*

JEL Classification Numbers: *J7,C3*

Introduction

Human trafficking and illegal migration pose a global concern, influencing virtually every nation on Earth. It is predominantly observed that the movement of individuals occurs from less developed nations to more advanced and industrialized ones (Li, 2008). People tend to migrate toward neighbouring countries with comparatively higher living standards. The illegal movement of individuals can encompass both internal and cross-border activities, with those voluntarily migrating being categorized as part of illegal migration.

A disturbing fact is that about 30% of victims are children, who are subjected to forced labour and sexual exploitation and all manner of other abuse. In a specific case, Punjab, Pakistan, witnessed 11,841 prosecutions, 9,548 convictions, and 118,932 victim identifications, whereas the broader global figures for prosecutions, convictions, and victim identifications are 1,024, 498,

[1] Lahore Business School, The University of Lahore, Pakistan
[2] Lahore Business School, The University of Lahore, Pakistan Khyzer_bin_dost@hotmail.com
[3] Department of Management Sciences, Rashid Latif Khan University, Lahore, Pakistan
[4] Lahore Business School, The University of Lahore, Pakistan
[5] Lahore Business School, The University of Lahore, Pakistan

CC BY NC ND

and 13,875, respectively, as reported by the U.S. Department of State in 2020. The United Nations office on drugs and crime (UNODC) estimates that in the year 2016, some 2.5 million people were smuggled for economic gain (UNODC, 2018). According to the United Nations (UN), human trafficking is defined as *"the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, or deception, of the abuse of power or a position of vulnerability or the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs"* (United Nations, 2000).

Illegal migration refers to the illegal and unauthorised movement of individuals across international borders and is a current issue with implications. Understanding the various drivers of illegal migration is a prerequisite to developing effective policies and interventions to address the complex issue of illegal migration. Illegal migration can be defined as *"smuggling of migrants" shall mean the procurement, to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefits, of the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident"*(UNODC, 2004).

The main objective of the present paper is to investigate the impact of socio-economic determinants on the economic satisfaction of human trafficking and illegal migration victims. In addition, this study aims to unveil whether demographic determinants such as marital status, family size, marital status and area of living impact on economic satisfaction. Moreover, the role of the effect of health and educational status on the economic satisfaction of the victims is another major purpose of the present study to be investigated.

In line with the aforementioned objectives, the present study endeavours to shed on light to the following research questions:

- Does income level lead to lesser economics satisfaction of human trafficking and illegal migration victims?
- Is there an effect of educational level and its expenses on economic satisfaction of human trafficking and illegal migration victims?
- Does the debt pressure lessen the economic satisfaction of the victims?
- Are the victims of human trafficking and illegal migration economically satisfied owing to their health status?
- Does financial stress lead to lower economic satisfaction?

Accordingly, rest of the paper is organized as follows: The next section presents the literature review based upon the previous studies on the economic aspect of human trafficking and migrant smuggling. Section 3 discusses the methodology, in which all the functional definitions, description of the variables and model specifications are given rigorously. Section 4 presents the empirical results and discussion throughout the empirical strategy, which is given in the previous section whereas the paper terminates with some concluding remarks and recommendations in the last section.

Literature Review

There has been a misinterpretation of human trafficking and illegal migration among professionals, leading to what Batsyukova (2012) termed as "conceptual confusion." In the contemporary world, illegal migration has evolved from small-scale border crossings into a highly profitable industry (Zard & Bhaba, 2006). Although information on illegal migration lacks authenticity, estimates suggest that around 0.8 million people are smuggled across international borders each year (Zard & Bhaba, 2006). Similarly, a significant number of individuals, including men, women, and children, fall victim to traffickers within and outside their countries. Trafficking affects nearly all countries worldwide, acting as either the origin, transit, or destination for victims (UNODC, 2014). It is important to distinguish these two offenses, even though they have many differences, as they are frequently confused with each other and trafficked in migrants are often confused with migration smuggling (Kaizen & Nonneman, 2007). It is therefore of the utmost importance to make a clear distinction between these two phenomena.

In the United Nations (UN) definition of human trafficking there have been "uncertainties and intricacies" (Quirk, 2007). Human trafficking is defined by the three following elements by the UN: "recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring, or receipt of a person" through "threat, coercion, force, abduction, deception, etc., and for the purpose of exploitation, including slavery, forced labour, or sexual exploitation. Other scholars believe that all three elements, act, means and purpose, are necessary to determine trafficking. However, Quirk (2007) argues that only one of these is enough to identify trafficking because it is important for the state to differentiate and identify individuals who may be at risk of trafficking and separate them from smuggling. Human trafficking involves the trafficking of persons through deception, force or fraud, for the sole purpose of exploitation (UNODC, 2014).

The services provided to migrants allow them to illegally cross international borders, entailing illegal crossing of the border for money or other goods. This situation is termed as human. This is known as human. smuggling. The protocols on trafficking and illegal migration are designed to provide a comprehensive definition. They can be used to identify criminal organisations across the globe (Shelley, 2010). These protocols strive to achieve international No agreement on the definition of illegal migration, nor on human trafficking. These, however, are interdependent and share some similarities in regard to their crimson has had difficulties in developing a universally accepted definition for both (crimes). To address this issue, the UN There have been differences made between the two protocols (Shelley, 2010).

Traffickers profit from exploiting their victims, while smugglers make money by charging migrants fees to help them cross borders illegally. This relationship is summarized as follows: "Migrants pay smugglers to deliver them illegally to their destination; the line into trafficking is crossed when migrants endure mistreatment"(Finnegan, 2008). According to Shelley (2010), the illegal movement of people involves an interconnected process

where both smugglers and traffickers exploit individuals. The distinction lies in the fact that traffickers exploit people, whereas smugglers assist people in migrating with their consent (Shelley, 2010). Smugglers take advantage of migrants' desperation to relocate for better opportunities. However, the offers made by smugglers are exploitative, although they do not pose

threats like traffickers do (Zard & Bhaba, 2006). When migrants lack alternatives, they may accept these opportunities, which can lead to coercive situations (Shelley, 2010). Additionally, trafficking victims have no control over the exploitation they face, while migrants lose their assets during migration under the control of smugglers. Migrants must comply with smugglers' orders for successful migration (Tamura, 2010). The willingness to migrate is associated with illegal migration, while forced migration characterizes trafficking.

According to the UN trafficking protocol, coercion is defined as "the abuse of power or a position of vulnerability." Factors contributing to the victim's vulnerability include poor health, limited education, poverty, and displacement (Zard & Bhaba, 2006). The question arises whether legal institutions will interpret the definition of abuse in such a comprehensive manner. In cases of illegal migration, there is consent from the migrant, who willingly participates and relinquishes control to the smuggler, making them vulnerable. This situation creates difficulty in distinguishing between smuggling and trafficking (Thompson et al., 2000). The differentiation between a smuggled migrant and a trafficked person is often based on the punishment imposed on the individual. Economic motives drive many people to engage in illegal migration due to high debt burdens and unfavourable job conditions (Chapkis, 2003).

Data and Empirical Strategy

In order to address the effects of human trafficking and migrant smuggling on economic satisfactions of victims, the empirical strategy consists of three steps. In this respect, the first step is devoted to the data issues and generation of the data set, whereas the second step introduces the detailed description of the variables. Yet, the last step presents the empirical models to be examined throughout the paper.

Data and Data Collection

The research in this present paper is based on questionnaire method to acquire primary data concerning the variables. However, the main obstacle faced within its cross-sectional scope pertains to the collection of data and the sampling process. In view of this, the selection of the sample is guided by the annual report on human trafficking and illegal migration (HT&MS), with districts chosen proportionally based on the number of registered cases. The focus is on collecting data from victims of human trafficking and illegal migration in specific regions identified by the Federal Investigation Agency of Pakistan as Anti Human Trafficking and Illegal migration Circles. These circles include in their jurisdiction areas of Lahore, Gujrat, Gujranwala, Faisalabad and Multan. In the Lahore zone includes the following districts: Lahore, Sheikhupura, Nankana, Kasur. The Gujranwala zone is made up of Gujranwala, Sialkot, Hafizabad and Narowal. Gujrat zone consists of Gujrat, Kharian and Mandi Bahauddin. Faisalabad circle consists of districts of Faisalabad, Sargodha, Khushab, Mianwali, Bhakkar and Jhang. Systematic random sampling is used to select the samples from the five circles of HT&MS. The sample population size is 419, with a 5% registered interval. All the cases from the five circles of the HT&MS. The systematic random sampling is used for the selection of the samples from the districts. The technique used, in which every 5th victim from the data is selected to be a part of the questionnaire.

Table 1. Sampling Data

Districts	Total Cases	Weight	Human Trafficking	Illegal migration	Sample Size (Total)
Lahore	1,121	20.16187	40	44	84
Gujrat	1,317	23.68705	47	52	99
Gujranwala	2,030	36.51079	73	80	153
Faisalabad	417	7.5	15	16	31
Multan	675	12.14029	24	27	51
	5560	**100**	**200**	**219**	**419**

Source: Authors' own computations based on the data retrieved from UNODC's Annual Report on Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling, 2020.

The economic status of human trafficking victims is an important aspect that needs to be studied. research. Various socio-economic and demographic indicators are used, such as income level, debt burden, The factors include health status, children's education, educational attainment, family size, place of residence, marital status, the victims' gender, as supported by research done by Chatfield (1977), Greenberg and Mogilner (2021), Hulsey (2018), IOM (2019), Naik (2014), Park (2018), and Schyns (2001). The factors that affect economic satisfaction The methodology chapter has been addressed to levels. This section explores the influence of the above: The role of socio-economic and demographic factors in the economic status of trafficking victim.

The economic satisfaction model within the illegal migration framework comprises variables with ordinal determinants (1, 2, ..., 5), necessitating the use of ordered logit regression for estimation. This approach effectively explains latent and unobserved variables (Cameron & Trivedi, 1986). (Joarder, 2014) also studied the economic satisfaction of illegal migrants and employed the ordered logistic regression model. Similarly, our current research utilizes ordered logistic regression as a more appropriate and superior method for our analysis. Specifically, we regress social and economic variables on the economic satisfaction of illegal migration victims. Furthermore, the avail opportunity model in the illegal migration framework involves categorical variables, requiring the use of logit regression for model estimation (Cameron & Trivedi, 1986). In a similar vein, Joarder (2014) employed the ordered logistic regression to investigate the various reasons behind individuals who seek opportunities to move abroad. In line with these previous studies, our current model employs logistic regression as a better and appropriate measure for our research. We add social and economic variables and regress them on the individuals who express a desire to avail opportunities despite being victims of illegal migration.

Definitions of the variables used (Operational)[6]

Economic Satisfaction of illegal migrant (Dependent Variable)

Economic factors primarily drive individuals to engage in illegal migration. The study assessed the economic contentment of smuggling victims using the question, 'How satisfied are you with your current economic situation?' Participants' responses were captured on a five-point Likert scale, ranging from 'not at all satisfied' to 'extremely satisfied.

Economic Satisfaction of Human trafficking (Dependent Variable)

The motivation for individuals to get involved in human trafficking is largely influenced by economic factors. The research examined the economic well-being of people being trafficked through the query, 'To what extent are you content with your present economic circumstances?' Participants' answers were recorded on a five-point Likert scale, spanning from 'not at all satisfied' to 'extremely satisfied'."

Income source, level, and outstanding debts

The study collects data from victims of illegal migration and human trafficking regarding their household income source both before and after the smuggling incident. Post-smuggling, individual income is evaluated, while household income is measured on a 23-point scale based on Buckler's (2008) methodology. In this study, household income categories are further refined, differing by 25,000 Pakistani rupees between each category, beginning from 'no income' and advancing onward. Additionally, the study employs a dummy variable format, representing income source and outstanding debts of smuggled migrants as 'No' and 'Yes'.

Health Status

The research examined the health condition of individuals impacted by Illegal migration and human trafficking after the incident. Victims' health status was classified based on the presence of health issues and the financial strain caused by healthcare expenses. Respondents were then prompted to specify the illnesses they were experiencing to validate this categorization. Furthermore, the survey included questions about the rising healthcare expenses, indicated as a dummy variable. It also investigated respondents' existing health needs and whether they were presently dealing with any illnesses (Khan & Nawaz, 2011).

Empirical Models

The study utilizes two distinct models to unveil the effect of socio-economic and demographic indicators on economic satisfactions of the victims of human trafficking and migrant smuggling. In the first model, the ESHT as the dependent variable for human trafficking. Several independent variables of a socio-economic and demographic nature were examined. Specifically, the variable 'IL' represents household income level, 'Dpressure' indicates the pressure of debts from lenders, 'Hstatus' denotes health status, 'Cedu' pertains to children's education, 'EDU' signifies the level

[6] See Appendix A1 for the detailed definitions of the variables.

of education, 'Fsize' represents family size, 'AOL' indicates the area of living, 'Mstatus' refers to the marital status of the victims, and 'Gender' distinguishes between male and female victims (1). All these variables were regressed against the economic satisfaction aspect of victims of human trafficking in the model. Continuous variables were standardized to facilitate a clear comparison of coefficient values.

$$ESHT_i = \gamma_0 + \gamma_1 IL_i + + \gamma_2 Dpressure_i + \gamma_3 Hcost_i + \gamma_4 Cedu._i + \gamma_5 EDU_i + \gamma_6 Fsize._i$$

$$+\gamma_7 AOL_i + \gamma_8 MStatus_i + \gamma_9 Gender_i + \varepsilon_i \quad (1)$$

where i=1, 2, 3…., k denotes the individuals and ε_i denotes the conventional disturbance term that follows i.i.d. process. As another distinct model, the present study considers the economic satisfaction of illegal migrants ($ESMS_i$) as the reliant variable in baseline specification, which is shown by the following equation:

$$ESMS_i = \gamma_0 + \gamma_1 Isource_i + \gamma_2 Odebts_i + \gamma_3 Hneed_i + \gamma_4 Fsize._i + \gamma_5 Fstress._i + \varepsilon_2 \quad (2)$$

Apart from equation 1, income source (Isource), "Odebts" represents outstanding debts (Odebts), health needs (Hneed), and financial stress (Fstress) enter as independent variables distinctively. All these variables were regressed against the economic satisfaction aspect of victims of illegal migration in the study. Continuous variables were standardized to facilitate a clear comparison of coefficient values. Both equations were estimated by employing ordered logistic regression method and the findings are discussed in the next section.

Results and Discussion

The economic well-being of victims involved in human trafficking was evaluated using a five-point "Likert" scale. The results showed that 33 percent were "moderately satisfied," and 38 percent were "very satisfied" with their economic situations. Among the 200 respondents, 70 percent were male, while 30 percent were female.

The respondents' residential areas were divided into rural (68 percent) and urban (32 percent) areas. These The monthly income of the individuals ranged from 25000-50000 Pakistan rupees. Amazingly, 87% of the respondents had no formal education. Up to 10 members were the average in a household. 66 percent had two or more children and 34 percent had family members. Those who have fallen into forced labour and debt bondage Many were burdened with considerable amounts of debt and 42 percent said they were pressured to pay back the debt. Interestingly, most There were no high-cost health needs among the respondents.

Economic satisfaction was measured on a five-point “Likert” scale which found that 39 percent were satisfied. "slightly satisfied." Specifically, around one-quarter indicated they were “not at all satisfied” or “very not satisfied” with the treatment they received. with their current economic situations, they are "satisfied. Of the respondents, 68 percent were able to obtain some source of income. upon their return. People who had been involved in illegal migration frequently had large outstanding debts, 61 of whom had outstanding debts. Not surprisingly, the vast majority of respondents had low-cost health care needs. Each average household had up to 10 members of

the family and 17 per cent of people had two or more children.

Financial strain is measured based on three variables: depression, irritability, and emotional exhaustion. These factors are rated on a five-point "Likert" scale representing levels of depression, irritation and emotional exhaustion as a result of financial stress. Approximately 29 percent of the people said they were “rarely, sometimes, or often depressed or sad” because of their economic situation, and about 7 percent said they felt “always depressed or sad” because of their economic situation. Additionally, 27 percent and 30 percent of people experienced "occasional" feelings of irritability and emotional exhaustion, respectively, because of their financial situation.

Table 2. Descriptive Statistics

Variables		**Frequency**	**Proportion (%)**
Economic Satisfaction of trafficked people (n=200)	Not at all satisfied	8	4.0
	Slightly satisfied	42	21.0
	Moderately satisfied	66	33.0
	Very satisfied	76	38.0
	Extremely satisfied	8	4.0
Economic Satisfaction of illegal migrants (n=219)	Not at all satisfied	63	28.8
	Slightly satisfied	86	39.3
	Moderately satisfied	52	23.7
Level of education (n=200)	Very satisfied	18	8.2
	Extremely satisfied	63	28.8
	Secondary of below secondary	6	3.0
Area of living (n=200)	Rural	136	68.0
	Urban	64	32.0
Marital Status (n=200)	Married	156	78.0
	Single	44	22.0
Gender (n=200)	Male	139	69.5
	Female	61	30.5
Debt Pressure (n=200)	No	62	42.2

	Yes	85	57.8
Health Status (n=200)	No	187	93.5
	Yes	13	6.5
Children Education (n=200)	No	105	52.5
	Yes	45	22.5
Income Source (n=219)	**No**	68	31.1
	Yes	151	68.9
Outstanding Debts (n=219)	**No**	85	38.8
	Yes	134	61.2
Health Status (n=219)	**No**	196	89.5
	Yes	23	10.5
Family Size (n=219)	**Up to 5**	72	32.9
	6-10	123	56.2
	11-15	20	9.1
	Above 15	4	1.8

Financial Stress	Depressed/Sad	Never	22	10.0
		Rarely	59	26.9
		Sometimes	59	26.9
		Often	64	29.2
		Always	15	6.8
	Irritated	Never	26	11.9
		Rarely	55	25.1
		Sometimes	59	26.9
		Often	49	22.4
		Always	30	13.7
	Emotionally Drained	Never	20	9.1
		Rarely	63	28.8
		Sometimes	66	30.1
		Often	47	21.5
		Always	23	10.5

Source: Authors' own computations.

The study operated an ordered logistic regression model (Table 3) to examine how socio-economic factors influence the economic satisfaction of individuals involved in human trafficking. The independent variables in this model included the respondent's income level, debt pressure, health status, children's education, and the respondent's own level of education. The regression results revealed that all these variables significantly affected the economic satisfaction of the respondents.

According to the findings, individuals in higher income brackets (earning between 25,001-50,000 and 50,001-75,000) reported notably higher economic satisfaction, with odds ratios of 1.76 and 8.73 respectively. This aligns with previous research Schyns (2001), indicating that higher income contributes to greater economic satisfaction. Conversely, those facing debt pressure or lender demands experienced a negative impact on economic satisfaction (odds ratio of 0.15), in line with the concept that increased debt pressure diminishes economic well-being (Greenberg & Mogilner, 2021).

Furthermore, individuals with health issues experienced decreased economic satisfaction (odds ratio of 0.15). This corroborates previous research by Chatfield (1977), highlighting the strain health issues put on individuals' economic satisfaction due to the income portion spent on healthcare. Concerns about children's education also negatively influenced economic satisfaction, indicating a reduction in overall satisfaction levels. Lastly, the respondents' own education levels (up to primary and up to secondary) negatively impacted economic satisfaction, suggesting that higher education levels led to decreased economic satisfaction."

Table 3. Ordered Logistic Regression Results

Variables	(1) Socio-Economic	(2) Demographic	(3) Overall
Economic Satisfaction	-	-	-
Income Level			
25,001-50,000	4.1438***		5.6218***
	(1.7669)		(2.8207)
50,001-75,000	94.7524***		95.8243***
	(87.3155)		(89.2908)
Debt Pressure: Yes	0.4239**		0.4017**
	(0.1584)		(0.1514)
Health status	0.3924**		0.3796**
	(0.1573)		(0.1796)
Children Education: Yes	0.4626**		0.5056*
	(0.1413)		(0.1791)
Education Level			
Primary or below	0.3121***		
	(0.1382)		
Secondary or below	0.0000***		
	(0.0000)		
Family Size		0.9873	1.0396
		(0.0719)	(0.1020)
Area of living: Urban		0.6070*	0.5723
		(0.1743)	(0.2457)
Marital Status: Single		2.3369***	8.4770**

		(0.6851)	(7.1044)
Gender: Female		0.5409**	0.5823
		(0.1688)	(0.2809)
Log likelihood	-125.38906	-256.03529	- 126.08926
Observations	116	200	116

Notes: Robust standard errors are in parentheses. *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1 denote the significance levels at 1%, 5%, and 10%.

Source: Authors' own calculations.

The results for control variables are presented in Table 3. In this model, the outcome variables were regressed against educational level, family size, area of living, marital status, and gender of the respondents.

All of the variables, with the exception of family size, had a significant effect on the outcome variable. Individuals However, those who live in urban areas were less satisfied with economic conditions because of higher prices and cost of living. In comparison to the rural areas, it shows a negative significant impact. Single persons, too, showed a negative significantly less satisfied with their economy, with an odds ratio of 0.68 (p<0.01), which means that people that are single are less satisfied with the economy. They are less economically satisfied (Chinchilla et al., 2012). In addition, the females reported less economic However, the payoff for women is not related to their work, but to the satisfaction they receive from their husband's work (which is generally not their own), and Leading to a negative significant impact on females satisfaction level about their economic status.

The model was specified with the following independent variables: income source of the respondent, excessive debt load, health, number of family members, and financial strain of the respondent. The regression results showed that all the independent variables except for had significant impacts on the economic satisfaction of the respondents. health status. A steady source of income had a highly positive effect on the economy. 2.56 is the probability of winning that satisfies. Those who took to illegal means and took loans for going out of country found themselves in the following situation: This gives rise to greater debt strain which translates to lower economic welfare (Greenberg & Mogilner, 2021). The rise in the odds were 0.59 that the economic satisfaction decreased as a result of debt. Participants who had health problems were also asked to respond. reported lower economic satisfaction, though the effect was not as strong (odds of 0.44). Notably, family There was an interesting relationship between size and economic satisfaction, with the increase in family size associated with an increase in satisfaction. This had a positive effect on economic satisfaction, possibly because of the increase in income earners in the household.

The study used ordered logistic regression model to assess the impact of socio-economic factors on a dependent variable of the non-binary type. Variables and outcomes related to economic satisfaction of those who partake in illegal migration These are presented in Table 4. The independent variables in this model included the respondent's income source, outstanding debt pressure, health status, family size, and the respondent's financial stress. The regression results revealed significant impacts of all independent variables on the economic satisfaction of

respondents, except for health status. Individuals with a stable income source exhibited a significantly positive impact on economic satisfaction, with odds of 2.56. Those who resorted to illegal means and borrowed money to go abroad experienced increased debt pressure, leading to diminished economic well-being (Greenberg & Mogilner, 2021). The rise in debt resulted in a decrease in economic satisfaction, with odds of 0.59. Respondents facing health issues also reported decreased economic satisfaction, with a negative but significant effect (odds of 0.44). Notably, family size exhibited an interesting relationship with economic satisfaction; an increase in family size positively influenced economic satisfaction, likely due to more earning members within the household. In addition, financial stress was identified as an important factor both prior to and subsequent to illegal migration. The study revealed that financial stress led to a reduction in economic satisfaction, suggesting that financial stress had a significant negative impact on respondents' economic well-being.

Table 4. Ordered Logistic Regression Results: Economic Satisfaction Model

Variables	Economic Satisfaction
Economic Satisfaction	-
Income source: Yes	2.5613***
	(0.7375)
Outstanding debts: Yes	0.5969*
	(0.1606)
Health Need: Yes	0.4449
	(0.2367)
Family Size	1.1078**
	(0.0466)
Financial Stress	0.5592***
	(0.0807)
Log likelihood	-133.75544
Observations	219

Notes: Robust standard errors are in parentheses. *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1 denote the significance levels at 1%, 5%, and 10%.

Source: Authors' own calculations.

Conclusion and Recommendations

This research has identified certain factors influencing the economy of human trafficking victims. and illegal migration, including income, employment, financial stress, education, health, children's education, debt, and family size. These factors can be beneficial or detrimental to the

economic situation of victims. Improving these indicators can make a huge difference in combating victimization in the area of human trafficking. and illegal migration. In addition, enhancing the human capital structure, and adopting effective government Improving policies, and strengthening the economic structure of a country has the potential to raise the socio-economic status of the nation.

The economic satisfaction model of human trafficking uses the ordered logit regression analysis to evaluate its determinants. An increase in income is correlated with a rise in human trafficking victims' satisfaction. In contrast, greater levels of debt tension reduce the economic satisfaction of victims; a higher debt load burdens victims, resulting in less satisfaction. Those who have health problems pay more for health care and are less satisfied. Satisfaction is also influenced by concerns about children's education, with the higher the level of concern, the lower the level of economic satisfaction. Surprisingly, education itself doesn't enhance the economic satisfaction of human trafficking victims. The economic satisfaction is lower for urban families due to increased costs. Curiously, people who are single are more satisfied with their economies, which may be due to the fact that they have no other financial obligations with family. Outcome measures are the economic satisfaction of illegal migrants.

Significant, it is that the economic satisfaction that those who returned from abroad report having had, prior to their departure, has a strong positive influence here. Surprisingly, education itself doesn't enhance the economic satisfaction of human trafficking victims. Interestingly, very good debt is not a good predictor of these people's economic satisfaction, and more debt corresponds to less economic well-being. In contrast, the greater the number of family members, the greater the economic satisfaction, which may be due to a larger number of earners within the family. Although indirectly, financial stress has a strong impact on economic satisfaction. In particular, dissatisfaction with finances is a negative correlate of satisfaction and the size of family is a direct determinant of economic satisfaction among illegal migrants.

The above results, along with the nature and specific details of the study, offer some concrete policy suggestions as follows:

1. Implement programs for economic empowerment, such as skill development, placement and entrepreneurship. The programs are designed to reduce financial burden and vulnerability.
2. Improve consumer protection legislation and rules to discourage predatory lending, fraudulent practices and financial exploitation. These measures are essential in minimizing increased financial stress and financial vulnerability.
3. Provide people with low income access to low cost loans and microfinance facilities, so that they can meet their financial needs in a responsible way, and reduce their exposure to predatory lending.
4. Engage with financial institutions to establish responsible lending practices, increase financial inclusion and provide assistance to the people in debt situation. The collaborative effort will be to stop them being vulnerable to trafficking in persons.
5. Improve access to quality health care, including preventive, primary and mental health services to people who are at risk of trafficking.

6. Ensure access to healthcare is affordable and accessible to all, irrespective of socio-economic status.

Acknowledgement: The authors are grateful to the anonymous reviewers for their precious and helpful comments.

Data availability: The data set used in this study can be provided by upon request.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization: SAJ, MS, BZ. Ethical supervision: SAJ, BZ.

Analysis and interpretation: SAJ, BZ, OÇ. Preparation and writing original draft: SAJ, MS, BZ, OÇ. All authors reviewed the results and approved the final version of the manuscript.

Statements and Declarations

Funding statement: "This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors."

Conflict of interest: No conflict of interest to disclose.

Ethics approval and consent to participate: All procedures performed in this study were in accordance with the ethical standards of the University of Lahore. The expert on ethics among the authors (SAJ) made sure that all the procedures respected all ethical standards involved in this design to minimize ethical risks.

Informed consent: Information about the study and the protection data rights was given to participants, who had to give their consent to their data recollection and treatment to participate in the study.

References

Batsyukova, S. (2012). Human trafficking and human smuggling: Similar nature, different concepts. *SCS Journal, 1*(1), 39-49.

Bishop, R. A., Morgan, C. V., & Erickson, L. (2013). Public awareness of human trafficking in Europe: How concerned are European citizens? *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies, 11*(2), 113-135. https://doi.org/10.1080/15562948.2013.759047

Bogdan, L. (2020). Public perception of human trafficking: a case study of Moldova. *Comparative Migration Studies, 8*(1), 1-14. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40878-020-00201-5

Buckler, K. (2008). Public opinion on illegal immigration: A test of seven core hypotheses. *Journal of Crime and Justice,* 31 (1), 113-147. https://doi.org/10.1080/0735648X.2008.9721246

Cameron, A. C., & Trivedi, P. K. (1986). Econometric models based on count data. Comparisons and applications of some estimators and tests. *Journal of Applied Econometrics,* 1 (1), 29-53. https://doi.org/10.1002/jae.3950010104

Chapkis, W. (2003). Trafficking, migration, and the law: Protecting innocents, punishing immigrants. *Gender & Society,* 17 (6), 923-937. https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243203257477

Chatfield, W. F. (1977). Economic and sociological factors influencing life satisfaction of the aged. *Journal of Gerontology,* 32 (5), 593-599. https://doi.org/10.1093/geronj/32.5.593

Chinchilla, N., Moragas, M., & Kim, S. (2012). Work and family decision-making framework: A motivational perspective: *IESE Research Papers*, D/959, IESE Business School.

Finnegan, W. (2008). The Countertraffickers: Saving women sold into prostitution. *NEW YORKER-NEW YORKER MAGAZINE INCORPORATED-, 2008*, 44.

Greenberg, A. E., & Mogilner, C. (2021). Consumer debt and satisfaction in life. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Applied,* 27 (1), 57. https://doi.org/10.1037/xap0000276

Hulsey, A. L. (2018). *Human trafficking: Flying under the radar.* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. University of Southern Mississippi.

IOM. (2019). *IOM Handbook on Protection and Assistance for Migrants Vulnerable to Violence, Exploitation and Abuse*. New York: United Nations. https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/avm_handbook.pdf

Joarder, M. A. M. (2014). *Essays on the economics of human trafficking, migration and remittances.* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation] Curtin University.

Kaizen, J., & Nonneman, W. (2007). Irregular Migration in Belgium and Organized Crime: An Overview 1. *International Migration,* 45 (2), 121-146. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2435.2007.00406.x

Lainez, N. (2022). Debt, trafficking and safe migration: The brokered mobility of Vietnamese sex workers to Singapore. *Geoforum*. 137, 164-173. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2020.01.021

Li, P. S. (2008). World migration in the age of globalization: Policy implications and challenges. *New Zealand Population Review,* 33 (34), 1-22.

Mortaza, N., Hanif, I., Ahmad Waraich, I., & Aziz Bukhari, S. Z. (2012). Does poverty stem human trafficking in Pakistan? *Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development,* 3 (10), 39-47.

Naik, K. C. (2014). *Human trafficking in Andhra Pradesh A study in Kadiri division of Anantapuramu district*.[Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Sri Krishnadevaraya University.

Park, H. (2018). *North Korean migrants in China: a case study of human smuggling and trafficking.* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Graduate School-Newark Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey

Quirk, J. (2007). Trafficked into slavery. *Journal of Human Rights,* 6 (2), 181-207. https://doi.org/10.1080/14754830601084576

Schyns, P. (2001). Income and satisfaction in Russia. *Journal of Happiness Studies,* 2 (2), 173-204. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1011564631319

Shelley, L. (2010). *Human trafficking: A global perspective*: Cambridge University Press.

Tamura, Y. (2010). Migrant smuggling. *Journal of Public Economics,* 94 (7-8), 540-548. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2010.03.005

Thompson, D., Europe, I. O. f. M. T. C. f., Staff, C. A., Laczko, F., & Thompson, D. (2000). *Migrant Trafficking and Human Smuggling in Europe*: *A Review of the Evidence with Case Studies from Hungary, Poland and Ukraine*. Geneva: United Nations, International Organization for Migration

United Nations. (2000). *United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (adopted general assembly*). New York: United

Nations. https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/Special/2000_Protocol_to_Prevent_2C_Suppress_and_Punish_Trafficking_in_Persons.pdf
UNODC. (2004). *United National Office of Drugs and Crime.* New York: United Nations.
UNODC. (2014). *United National Office of Drugs and Crime*. New York: United Nations.
UNODC. (2018). *Annual Report.* New York: United Nations. https://www.unodc.org/documents/AnnualReport/Annual-Report_2018.pdf
UNODC. (2020). *Annual Report on Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling.* New York: United Nations. https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/HTMSS_Annual_Report_2020.pdf
Williams, J. (2020). Soroptimist International's Work in the Prevention of Modern-Day Slavery: Wales as a Good Practice Example of Partnership Working. *The Palgrave International Handbook of Human Trafficking*, 1445-1461.
Zard, M., & Bhaba, J. (2006). Smuggled or trafficked? *Forced Migration Review* (25), 6-8.
.